

GCE

History A

Unit : Y316/01 Britain and Ireland 1791 - 1921

Advanced GCE

Mark Scheme for June 2018

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA) is a leading UK awarding body, providing a wide range of qualifications to meet the needs of candidates of all ages and abilities. OCR qualifications include AS/A Levels, Diplomas, GCSEs, Cambridge Nationals, Cambridge Technicals, Functional Skills, Key Skills, Entry Level qualifications, NVQs and vocational qualifications in areas such as IT, business, languages, teaching/training, administration and secretarial skills.

It is also responsible for developing new specifications to meet national requirements and the needs of students and teachers. OCR is a not-for-profit organisation; any surplus made is invested back into the establishment to help towards the development of qualifications and support, which keep pace with the changing needs of today's society.

















This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which marks were awarded by examiners. It does not indicate the details of the discussions which took place at an examiners' meeting before marking commenced.

All examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the published question papers and the report on the examination.

© OCR 2018

These are the annotations, (including abbreviations), including those used in scoris, which are used when marking

Annotation	Meaning of annotation
	Blank Page
	Highlight
Off-page comment	
	Assertion
	Analysis
	Continuity/Change
	Evaluation
	Explanation
	Factor
	Illustrates/Describes
	Irrelevant, a significant amount of material that does not answer the question
	Judgement
	Knowledge and understanding
	Simple comment
	Synthesis
	Unclear
	View

Here are the subject specific instructions for this question paper

Use the following indicative content mark scheme in conjunction with the generic levels of response in the Appendix.

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
1	<p>Evaluate the interpretations in both of the two passages and explain which you think is more convincing as an explanation of why there was opposition to the creation of the Union in 1800.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In locating the Interpretations within the wider historical debate, answers might argue that Interpretation A suggests that opposition occurred due to the fear of a loss of Irish national identity and sovereignty. • In evaluating Interpretation A, answers might argue that the opponents were not speaking on behalf of the majority of the Irish population who were Catholics. • Answers might argue that ‘Grattan’s Parliament’ did little to improve the political rights of Catholics. • Answers might argue that Interpretation A is not valid as the rebellion of 1798 suggested a disunited Ireland and one with different views about identity. • Answers might argue that the Protestant Ascendency had little intention of considering Catholic emancipation and parliamentary reform. • Answers might argue that Interpretation A is not valid as the anti-Union camp was in fact disunited. • In locating the Interpretations within the wider historical debate, answers might argue that Interpretation B claims that opposition came mainly in the form of one person, Foster, and his belief that Ireland had managed its affairs very well without mainland interference • In evaluating Interpretation B, answers might argue that Interpretation B is valid as it highlights the disunity within the anti-Unionist camp. • Answers might argue that Interpretation B is valid as it stresses that Ireland would not benefit from free- 	30	

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<p>trade; after 1800 the Irish economy only grew at a very slow rate.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might argue that Interpretation B is valid as it highlights Foster's prediction about the end of the Protestant Ascendancy; as with the economy, the Ascendancy went into steady decline after the Act of 1800. • Answers might argue that Interpretation B is valid as, overall, it infers the anti-Unionists' cause was weak and that without Foster their arguments would hardly have been listened to. They represented only a minority of Irish people. 		
2	<p>'Parnell was by far the most successful leader of constitutional nationalism in the period from 1798 to 1921.' How far do you agree?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In supporting the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that Parnell was relatively more successful than other leaders of constitutional nationalism especially O'Connell (1823-45), Butt (1873-79), Redmond (1889-1918) and Dillon (1918-19). • Answers might consider that success might be measured by looking at similarities and differences in leadership qualities, the deployment of strategy and tactics, campaigning tools and the extent to which aims were achieved. • Answers might consider that Parnell, especially when compared to O'Connell, was effective in achieving land reform (he forced Gladstone to reconsider Land Reform in the 1880s by linking Davitt's Land League to his cause). • Answers might consider that Parnell was very successful in creating a disciplined Parliamentary 	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<p>party in the 1870s and 1880s.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that Parnell’s aims were very focused on tactics at Westminster (‘obstructionism’) and he gained complete control of the Irish political process outside Ulster. • Answers might consider that Parnell never recovered from the O’Shea Divorce case and this lost him Catholic support. • In challenging the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that O’Connell’s achievements were far greater than later leaders: Emancipation in the 1820s, its practical implementation and his success in achieving reform within the Union in the 1830s all stand out. • Answers might consider that O’Connell struggled in his dealings with Peel. • Answers might consider that Butt was successful in founding the Irish Nationalist Party. • Answers might consider that Redmond achieved Home Rule (although not its implementation). • Answers might consider that Redmond was successful in leading the reunion of the Irish Parliamentary Party in 1900. • Answers might consider that Redmond could be accused of neglecting grass roots support in a way that O’Connell and Parnell never did. • Answers might consider that unlike O’Connell and Parnell, Redmond was never considered an ‘uncrowned’ King of Ireland’. 		
3	<p>To what extent were the Whig and Liberal parties successful in helping bring stability to the Union from 1800 to 1921?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In supporting the hypothesis in the question, 	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<p>answers might consider that Gladstone's Liberal governments during the period from 1868 to 95 were the most successful; they did well to deal with the challenges of land and tenant issues, the emergence of an Irish nationalist party and a major downturn in the agrarian economy (1880's).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider Gladstone's success with the Disestablishment of the Irish Church in 1869, the passing of the Land Acts of 1870 and 1882 and in dealing with Parnell and Davitt in the 1880's. • Answers might consider how well the Liberals dealt with the challenge of Home Rule. • Answers might consider that the Whig governments in the 1830s were also successful (for example, with the creation of the Lichfield House compact). • Answers might consider the impact of Liberal presence in the Coalition governments from 1915 to 1921. • In challenging the hypothesis in the question, answers might consider the 'quiet' role played by the Whigs in the debates over the creation of the Union. • Answers might consider that Gladstone's land policies were flawed (for example, the lack of impartiality of land courts). • Answers might consider that there was not a Liberal consensus over Home Rule. • Answers might consider that the Coalition governments of the later part of the period found it difficult to deal with the instability created by Partition and Home Rule. 		<p>and accurate material.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
4	<p>‘Agrarian under-development was the major economic influence on the development of Irish Nationalism from 1791 to 1921.’ How far do you agree?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In supporting the hypothesis in the question, answers might consider that certainly up to c.1850 Ireland had not experienced an ‘agricultural revolution’ such as that in England; food supplies struggled to keep up with the demands from a growing population. • Answers might consider the impact of monoculture (potato production) on the economy and Irish nationalism. • Answers might consider that poor relations between landlords and tenants hindered ‘progress’ (and were not addressed until the period from 1870 to 1903). • Answers might consider the significance of Davitt’s Land League and agrarian violence. • Answers might consider the impact of the Great Hunger on Irish nationalism. • In challenging the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that there were other important economic influences on Irish nationalism especially those related to industrialization in the north and the regional divide in general. • Answers might consider that the creation of the Union did not lead to greater industrial investment (and therefore trade) as was expected. • Answers might consider that industrial modernization occurred at a very slow rate especially in the old staples (textiles, metal working). • Answers might consider that shipbuilding and engineering did ‘take-off’ in the north (Belfast). 	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation; it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Answers might consider that generally the Irish economy relied on the export of raw materials; there was an impression that the economy remained relatively poor which fueled Irish nationalism.		

APPENDIX 1 – this contains the generic mark scheme grids

	<i>AO3: Analyse and evaluate, in relation to the historical context, different ways in which aspects of the past have been interpreted.</i>
	Generic mark scheme for Section A, Question 1: Interpretation [30]
Level 6 26–30 marks	The answer has a very good focus on the question throughout. It has thorough and sustained evaluation of the interpretations, using detailed and accurate knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce a convincing and supported analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 5 21–25 marks	The answer has a good focus on the question throughout. It has good evaluation of the interpretations, using relevant knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce a supported analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 4 16–20 marks	The answer is mostly focused on the question. It has evaluation of the interpretations based on generally relevant knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce an analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 3 11–15 marks	The answer is partially focused on the question. It has partial evaluation of the interpretations based on some knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue. There may be some use of information from one of the two interpretations to support the evaluation of the other, but the evaluation will not rely on this. There is a limited analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question.
Level 2 6–10 marks	The answer has a limited focus on the question. Parts of the answer are just description of the interpretations, with evaluation in relation to historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue being weak, and evaluation relying heavily on information drawn from the other interpretation. There is a very limited analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question.
Level 1 1–5 marks	The answer has some relevance to the topic, but not the specific question. The answer consists mostly of description of the interpretations with very limited evaluation based on very generalised knowledge of historical context and minimal or no reference to the wider historical debate. Analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question is either in the form of assertion or lacking.
0 marks	No evidence of understanding and no demonstration of any relevant knowledge.

	<i>AO1: Demonstrate, organise and communicate knowledge and understanding to analyse and evaluate the key features related to the periods studied, making substantiated judgements and exploring concepts, as relevant, of cause, consequence, change, continuity, similarity, difference and significance.</i>
	Generic mark scheme for Section B, Questions 2, 3 and 4: Essay [25]
Level 6 21–25 marks	The answer has a very good focus on the question. Detailed and accurate knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a fully developed synthesis supporting a convincing and substantiated judgement. There is a well-developed and sustained line of reasoning which is coherent and logically structured. The information presented is entirely relevant and substantiated.
Level 5 17–20 marks	The answer has a good focus on the question. Generally accurate and detailed knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a developed synthesis supporting a substantiated judgement. There is a well-developed line of reasoning which is clear and logically structured. The information presented is relevant and in the most part substantiated.
Level 4 13–16 marks	The answer is mostly focused on the question. Relevant knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a synthesis supporting a reasonable judgement. There is a line of reasoning presented with some structure. The information presented is in the most-part relevant and supported by some evidence.
Level 3 9–12 marks	The answer has a partial focus on the question. Some relevant knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and explain key features of the period studied in order to attempt an undeveloped synthesis, which is linked to a judgement, though the supporting explanation may lack detail and clarity. The information has some relevance and is presented with limited structure. The information is supported by limited evidence.
Level 2 5–8 marks	The answer has only a limited focus on the question. Limited relevant knowledge and understanding is used to give a limited explanation and analysis of key features of the period studied. There is a judgement but this may not be clearly linked with the supporting explanation. The information has some relevance, but is communicated in an unstructured way. The information is supported by limited evidence and the relationship to the evidence may not be clear.
Level 1 1–4 marks	The answer has a limited focus on the topic, but not the specific question. The answer is largely descriptive, with only very generalised knowledge of the period studied being used to attempt basic explanation and very limited analysis. Judgements are unsupported and are not linked to analysis. Information presented is basic and may be ambiguous or unstructured. The information is supported by limited evidence.
0 marks	The answer contains no relevant information.

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)
The Triangle Building
Shaftesbury Road
Cambridge
CB2 8EA

OCR Customer Contact Centre

Education and Learning

Telephone: 01223 553998

Facsimile: 01223 552627

Email: general.qualifications@ocr.org.uk

www.ocr.org.uk

For staff training purposes and as part of our quality assurance programme your call may be recorded or monitored

Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations
is a Company Limited by Guarantee
Registered in England
Registered Office; The Triangle Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge, CB2 8EA
Registered Company Number: 3484466
OCR is an exempt Charity

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)
Head office
Telephone: 01223 552552
Facsimile: 01223 552553

© OCR 2018

